

The Position of Local Religions in Interfaith Relations as a Form of Religious Moderation in Indonesia

Indonesian Journal of Religion and Society, 2023, Vol. 5 (2), 112-124 © The Journal, 2023 DOI : 10.36256/ijrs.v5i1.369

www.journal.lasigo.org/index.php/IJRS

Journal

Article History Received : November 2nd, 2023 Revised : December 4th, , 2023 Accepted : December 14th, 2023

Muhammad Daffa Universitas Gadjah Mada, Indonesia <u>muhammaddaffa2001@mail.ugm.ac.id</u>

Indra Anggara

Universitas Jenderal Ahmad Yani, Indonesia anggaraindra964@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

The Constitutional Court granted the petition for judicial review of the regulation to empty the religion column for indigenous faiths in family cards and electronic ID cards on November 7, 2017. This research focuses on the role of local religions in interfaith relations as a manifestation of religious moderation in Indonesia. Using qualitative data through literature study, this research explores the contribution of local religions in creating moderation, especially through moderation values that accommodate local wisdom. Local religions and moderation in religion can coexist, creating harmony in interfaith relations. This study highlights that ancestral and local religions have continued relevance in the face of changing times, making them important contributors to religious moderation and interfaith relations in Indonesia. By considering the Pancasila perspective of local religions, this study reveals how national values and history shape religious moderation. Meanwhile, local religions provide a foundation for building a harmonious society by raising awareness of relationships with nature and the environment. The findings suggest that history, nationality and the preservation of natural harmony by local religions simultaneously contribute to religious moderation in the context of local religions in Indonesia.

Keywords: Local Religion; Interfaith; Religious Moderation.

1. Introduction

As applicants in case number 97/PUU-XIV/2016, Nggay Mehang Tana, Pagar Damanra Sirait, Arnol Purba, and Carlim sought a legal audit on September 28, 2016, stating that certain articles in the Community Organization Regulation clashed with Article 1 paragraph (3) of the 1945 Constitution. They asserted that the challenge to obtain Family Cards (KK) and electronic ID cards abused the established freedoms. The Constitutional Court approved the survey on November 7, 2017, ruling that the special arrangements were invalid, allowing adherents of religions that do not have a religious equivalent to the legitimate ones to still have executive freedoms (Viri & Febriany, 2020). In interfaith relationships, there aren't many conversations about local religions in Indonesia. This study investigates the job of Indonesian nearby religions in cultivating moderate persons inside interfaith relations, consistently coordinating the protected and worldwide basic freedoms structure. Article 28E paragraphs 1 and 2 of the second amendment to the Constitution of 1945, in particular, emphasize

individual religious freedom. The assertion "The State depends on the One Genuine God" further reveres the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR) and the International Covenant on Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights (ICESCR) on October 28, 2005, demonstrates its commitment to human rights and raises concerns regarding the protection of religious freedom. In accordance with constitutional provisions and international human rights standards, recognizing and promoting Local Religion in interfaith relationships contributes to the larger objectives of religious moderation (Budijanto, 2016). Consequently, the right to religion is one of the rights that cannot be diminished. The right to practice one's religion is protected by the Indonesian Constitution.

Previous research related to the discussion of religious moderation is entitled, "*Penguatan Agama dan Wawasan Budaya sebagai Upaya dalam Menumbuhkan Spirit Moderasi Beragama*," by Muna. C and Lestari. P (2023), al-Afkar, Journal for Islamic Studies. In a multicultural society should foster respect for differences, but the ongoing discussion of SARA, especially on social media, indicates a lack of realization. Unchecked, this issue can lead to division, requiring intervention to promote diversity. This study aims to provide tips for fostering religious moderation through a literature review approach. Results emphasize the inseparable unity of strengthening religion and cultural insight. Efforts to cultivate tolerance and maintain diversity are urgent in this disruptive era. Models for strengthening religious and cultural understanding become crucial steps in reorganizing and fortifying the relationship between religion and culture within the framework of tolerance (Muna & Lestari, 2023).

The current research is reinforced by previous research. What previous research suggests may provide opportunities for additional investigation. It is important to realize that the current and previous research have similarities and differences. The topic of religious moderation has similarities with previous and current research. However, the body of knowledge in this research has new differences. Local religions' perspectives on interfaith relations are presented in this study as examples of Indonesia's moderate character. This makes the current research provide novelty in the form of the position of local religions in religious relations and its relation to religious moderation.

A controversial book written by Daniel Dubuisson was widely criticised by religious scholars for its criticism of religious studies. The title of the book is The Western Construction of Religion. Daniel Dubuisson asserts in the book that "religion" is based on Western culture and history (Ali-Fauzi et al., 2017). James George Frazer, an admirer and disciple of Tylor who lived from 1854 to 1941, distinguished between magic and religion, which are appropriate for people who still reason. He says that dependence or faith in supernatural powers is the core of religion. According to Radcliffe-Brown (1881-1955), religion is "an expression of awareness of dependence on a power outside of ourselves called spiritual or moral power" in one form or another. According to Auguste Comte, a sociologist of religion who lived from 1798 to 1857, religious thinking looks for absolute answers to everything, like attributing the cause of all events to God's will (Sirnopati, 2021). Another thing about the original definition of culture from E.B. Tylor is that culture or civilisation is a complex whole that includes knowledge, belief, art, morals, the law, customs, and any other skills and habits that people learn as part of society. According to Tylor, culture is a complex whole that includes knowledge, beliefs, arts, morals, laws, and other abilities and habits that man acquires as a member of society. This limitation of culture suggests the material aspect rather than the material itself or material and non-material (Miharja, 2017).

In accordance with *maqasid* reasoning, the Constitutional Court's decision to include Penghayat Kepercayaan in the religion column of ID cards and Family Cards is regarded as a crucial step toward the advancement of human rights. This incorporation advances civil rights, non-segregation, and equivalent admittance to public administrations and schooling. It additionally enables adherents to take part effectively in significantly shaping society, accentuating the significance of maintaining key basic liberties, including strict opportunity, schooling, security, social privileges, and financial freedoms (Hasibuan, 2019).

Religious moderation in Indonesia is not a moderated Indonesia; rather, it is a way of understanding religion that must be moderate due to Indonesia's many cultures and customs. This means that religious moderation in Indonesia must be understood contextually rather than textually (Fahri & Zainuri, 2019). Even Lukman Hakim Saifuddin, Minister of Religious Affairs, declared 2019 the Ministry of Religious Moderation Year. The year 2019 was also declared The International Year of Moderation by the United Nations (Sutrisno, 2019).

The article dives into the focal issue of how Indonesian neighbourhood religions effectively add to the improvement of a moderate person inside the setting of interfaith connections. The formulation of the problem centres on comprehending how these local belief systems shape interfaith interaction participants' moderate personalities. The study has theoretical significance by expanding our comprehension of the intricate relationship between local religions and interfaith dynamics and contributing to the broader knowledge of religious studies. It improves hypothetical structures connected with interfaith discourse, multiculturalism, and the job of nearby conviction frameworks in encouraging resilience and understanding. The research offers useful insights for individuals, communities, and policymakers involved in interfaith initiatives on a practical level. Understanding the positive effect of nearby religions on developing a moderate person illuminates systems for advancing serene concurrence and exchange among different strict networks. These useful advantages help cultivate a more comprehensive and agreeable cultural climate, empowering common regard and participation.

2. Theoretical Framework

Since the state established the Department of Religious Affairs in the early years of 1946, religion has been defined for religious management policy. According to some academics, the Department of Religious Affairs was initially established solely to serve Muslims' aspirations, but it later expanded to include and serve religions other than Islam (Katz and Katz 1975, 658; Intan 2008, 44; Geertz 1960, 200), though there were only six (in the Old Order, five in the New Order, and six in the Reformation) (Ali-Fauzi et al., 2017). Every definition of religion is questioned and criticised, resulting in mistrust. There are numerous definitions of religion. A definition can be offered to clarify the topic at the start of a conversation. However, they may also be proposed at the conclusion as an accomplishment or consequence of recognising a phenomenon. In any case, both assume the existence of a distinct entity known as "religion" that can be identified and distinguished from other entities. The existence of that entity has been questioned, as have many recent religious scholars. Indirectly posing a question implies asserting that the entity was created through social construction or invention (Bagir & Maarif, 2016). In socioanthropological studies, "agama" translates the English word "religion." However, it is not the same as "religion" in the political-administrative language of the Republic of Indonesia's government. Everything referred to as religion in this essay, including revelation, natural, and local religion, is called religion. In the political and administrative sense of the Republic of Indonesia's government, "religion" refers to the official religions recognised by the government, which include Islam, Protestant Christianity, Catholicism, Hinduism, Buddhism, and, more recently, Khonghucu (Marzali, 2017).

Local religion is a way of life based on the indigenous system of the archipelago with philosophical values and harmony that includes the community. Many people are unaware that, despite the ban on "official" religions in Indonesia, there are still indigenous religions or beliefs, such as Sunda Wiwitan, which Sundanese follows in Kanekes, Lebak, and Banten; Sunda Wiwitan aliran Madrais and is also referred to as the Cigugur religion (and many other names) in Cigugur, Kuningan, and West Java; Religion of the Buhun in West Java; East and Central Java's Kejawen; Parmalim religion, Batak religion; Kaharingan in all of Kalimantan; Tonaas Walian belief in Minahasa, North Sulawesi; In South Sulawesi, Tolottang; In Lombok, Wetu Telu; Naurus, Maluku's Seram Province, and its surroundings (Muttaqien, 2013). The Directorate of Belief in God Almighty and Indigenous Peoples, Directorate General of Culture, and Ministry of Education and Culture of the Republic of Indonesia have registered 188 indigenous faith organisations. 11,288,957 believers have joined these organisations altogether. The number is higher than stated because numerous Java and non-Java believers have yet to register (Maarif, 2019).

Indonesia's society is pluralistic and culturally diverse. Culture, religion, race, language, ethnicity, traditions, and so on are all examples of diversity. The harmony of life is disrupted when cultural groups in such a multicultural society engage in tensions and conflicts (Adnan & Somantri, 2022; Akhmadi, 2019). In the teachings of Mei Kartawinata, the terms *jirim* (*raga salira*), *jisim* (*raga purasa*), and *kuring* (*raga Batara*) all refer to the self. "*Kuring mah henteu jangkung henteu pendek, henteu bodas henteu hideung, lain kolot lain budak, lain awewe lain lalaki, tapi kuring aya di kolot aya di budak aya di awewe, aya di lalaki. Kuring mah lain lahir lain batin tapi nu dilahiran jeung nu dibatinan (dijiriman jeung dijisiman*)." The distinction between *jelema* and *manusa* is the presence of *kuring* (Kartawinata & Pujanegara, 2022). The attitude or character possessed is what makes the difference in meaning. Characters who do

not comprehend or exhibit attitudes consistent with the teachings are referred to as *jelema*. Meanwhile, *manusa* denotes either the noble creatures of God or their good deeds. The Ministry of Religious Affairs' efforts to promote religious moderation gain traction now and in the future (Sutrisno, 2019). In managing religious life in Indonesia's multicultural and pluralistic society, it is essential to frame religious moderation. Surprisingly, it turns out that all recognised religions in Indonesia recognise the teachings of religious moderation.

3. Method

Oualitative data are the type of data used in this study. Similar to other forms of qualitative research, such as text studies, phenomenology, ethnography, and ethnomethodology (Radix & Siti, 2019). Library research is a systemically thorough exploration technique used to coordinate assessment. The four processes in this study are the formulation of a specific review question, a comprehensive and in-depth search of primary studies, the establishment of inclusion and exclusion criteria, and the evaluation of the quality of the included studies. This is because phenomenology and history can work well together (Tama & Sulistyaningrum, 2023; Yusuf, Afrizal, & Alfiandi, 2022). This type of research involves collecting data from various sources of library information, such as books, encyclopedias, scientific journals, newspapers, magazines, and other documents. (Tahar, Setiadi, & Rahayu, 2022). Robson and McCartan (2016) outline a methodology that focuses on transformative design as a whole. Therefore, the authors of this article analyze a number of theoretical assumptions relating to (Kulikov & Shirokova, 2021). Qualitative methodology does not use factual testing with statistics, but rather describes information in the form of thoughts, ideas, values, and deciphering ideas that cannot be estimated with numbers (Tresnasih, Rostiyati, Merlina, & Lasmiyati, 2023). Qualitative research highlights the meanings that can integrate with the position of local religions in interfaith relations as a form of religious moderation in Indonesia.

4. Religious Moderation and Local Religion Interfaith Relations 4.1. Religious Moderation in Indonesia

In Indonesia, a long tradition of interfaith dialogue and cultural diversity has shaped the discourse of religious moderation. The character of Pancasila, a symbolic concept in Indonesia, aligns with the principles of moderation that are ingrained in the day-to-day practices of various religions. Indonesia has signed the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), which recognizes everyone's entitlement to freedom of religion, belief, and thought. In addition, the constitution guarantees Indonesia has signed the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights effect of this talk lies in cultivating an environment of strict resilience and variety in Indonesia, advancing concurrence and understanding among various beliefs.

Understanding religion itself is essential before learning more about religious moderation. Although religious moderation can be a natural part of human nature in practice. Moral teachings, movement ideologies, highly individualised spiritual journeys, acts of mass violence, soothing rituals, and suffocating demagogic lectures are all forms of religion (Melia, 2022). Therefore, defining religion in a way that is accurate and acceptable to most people is the first challenge in conducting scientific research on religion. Religion has always been received and experienced religiously.

"Religion is the belief in one God and the laws revealed to His messengers for the happiness of human life in this world and the hereafter," wrote Mukti Ali, a former Indonesian minister of religion. Ali is not referring to religion as a whole (Jupri, 2015; Rakhmat, 2021a). He is defining religion in the context of Islam for him. Not all religions believe in one God, using only the major religions as examples. The word "Esa" can be omitted from Mukti Ali's definition of religion, similar to James Martineau's definition: Religion is the belief in an immortal God, also known as the Divine Soul and will, who governs the universe and has a moral bond with human beings. However, Hinayana Buddhism and Confucianism are excluded from religions under this definition. Belief in a personal God is entirely absent in these religions. Scientists use the terms "transcendent reality", "power above man", and "something beyond man" (A Beyond) to cover all religions, "supernatural realities" and "transcendent realities." The study of God and similar ideas is usually referred to as theology. Unfortunately, or fortunately, not all religions have a theology or even discuss it (Rakhmat, 2021a).

Moderation comes from the Latin word "moderāte", which means to control or reduce. Moderate, according to the American Heritage Dictionary of the English Language, is neither too much nor too extreme. The correct definition for religious moderation is religious values built on a straight and middle mindset, as this etymological meaning implies an objective and non-extreme attitude. Religious moderation is a perspective or attitude that always tries to find a middle way between two extreme points of view so that no one point of view dominates one's thoughts and actions (Saputra et al., 2021). In other words, a moderate believer places each opposing value or aspect in its proper proportion. Regardless of identity, everyone cannot escape the influences and biases of tradition, thought, family, age, and location.

Indonesia is a country with a multicultural society due to the diversity of cultures, religions, ethnicities, and languages. If managed well, this diversity can be unique and strong. However, such diversity can be challenging if not addressed wisely, posing a threat of division and competition that can tear apart social security. Each ethnic group encounters its cultural behaviour and has a different way of life; therefore, cultural diversity is a natural phenomenon in a place. Cross-culturalism, as experienced by culturally diverse Americans due to the presence of diverse cultures and gathering in one country, is different from multiculturalism. Individual differences have many different meanings in multiculturalism, while ethnic differences are the focus of attention in cross-culturalism. Linguistically, multiculturalism is understood as the understanding of multiple cultures (Akhmadi, 2019). Culture in the sense that it is an idiom and a tool to reach the highest level of humanity. Therefore, looking at culture in social institutions from a functional and operational perspective is essential. Normative multiculturalism and descriptive multiculturalism are well-known terms. The social reality that reflects pluralism is descriptive multiculturalism (Gianni, 2023). The normative multiculturalism developing in Indonesia today is related to the moral foundation, namely the moral bond of citizens within the scope of the state or nation to do something that becomes a joint agreement.

The extent to which a religious person is willing to accept religious practices that accommodate local culture and traditions is a measure of one's religious attitude and behaviour. As long as it does not contradict the central teachings of their religion, a moderate attitude can undoubtedly reflect a friendly attitude in accepting local traditions and cultures as part of their religion. Indonesia has a diversity of religions, tribes, ethnicities, languages, and cultures. These differences are very important to recognise as they can cause friction and conflict, contributing to the unstable life of the nation. "Religious moderation" does not only refer to Islam but also to all religions that exist in pluralistic Indonesia (Junaedi, 2019). Since all religions essentially share the same human values, it is necessary to raise awareness that the value of moderation exists in all religions. The meaning of moderation in the context of religion is explained throughout the book so that all religious communities can understand it. This explanation is important because religious moderation is the essence of religion and needs to be practised in a pluralistic and multicultural society like Indonesia.

In addition, the economic and political landscape will undoubtedly undergo structural shifts due to globalisation. In other words, these areas can have both global and universal structures. However, it is difficult for values derived from local religions or traditions to truly become universal because, in many ways, they are tied to local realities (Sudirman, 2022). Conflicts can occur here between local and regional cultures that are religious in nature and cultures or civilisations that have global ambitions, such as the West. It is also naive to believe that civilisations are not at war with each other. Many affinities, similarities, and commonalities exist between civilisations. However, it must be recognised that differences can also lead to conflict, especially when they are exploited - not to say manipulated - to serve particular interests (Azra, 2002). Interestingly, however, this distinctive doctrine also recognises the teaching of religious moderation or having a central principle. Religious moderation is a way to moderate some extreme interpretations of Christianity held by some sect adherents. Interacting as much as possible within the internal religious community between members of different religions and sects is one way to promote religious moderation. The Catholic Church's view offers another perspective on religious moderation. In the Catholic Church, the term "moderate" is rarely used; "open" to "fundamentalists" and "traditionalists" (who reject renewal in the Catholic Church sense).

The middle way, or moderation in religion, dates back thousands of years in the Hindu tradition. *Satya Yuga, Treta Yuga, Dwapara Yuga,* and *Kali Yuga* are the four *Yuga's* that comprise the time period. As a form of moderation, Hindus adapted their teachings in each Yuga. Moderation became a historical necessity to overcome the chaos of the time and adapt religious teachings to the times. *Tri Sandhya Puja* and *Panca Sembah* are two modern religious practices Hindus practice in Indonesia. Since the Parisadha was founded in the

1960s, they have been the central axis of Indonesian Hindu culture. Many other Hindu practices are related to the practice of these two theologies. The *Puja Tri Sandhyadan Panca Sembah* is enriched by art and ritual.

Susila, or maintaining harmonious relationships among people, is one of the three causes of well-being and is Hinduism's most important teaching on religious moderation. In all religions, compassion is the most crucial aspect of moderation. The essence of Buddhism's teaching on religious moderation can be seen in the Enlightenment of Sidharta Gautama. He vowed to follow four precepts: to help all beings, to reject all desires from the outside world, to study, live and practice the *Dharma*, and to strive for Perfect Enlightenment. Religious moderation is also rooted in Confucianism. A *junzi* (faithful and virtuous) Confucianist views life through the lens of *yin* and *yang*, as *yin* and *yang* are their spirituality, thought, and philosophy. Instead of being an extreme stance, *yin yang* is a middle stance. Less of it is as bad as more (Sutrisno, 2019).

Azyumardi Azra says that Indonesia is lucky because the Islam that has developed there is *wasathiyah* Islam since Islamisation began in this region in the mid-13th century. Islam with this style that can be seen actualised in Indonesia has characters, among others, *tawashut* (middle), *tawazun* (balanced), *i'tidal* (fair), *tasamuh* (tolerant), *islah* (reformist), *ta'awun* (helping /mutual cooperation), and *shura*/ deliberation (consultation), *musawa* (equality), *muwathanah* (love of the country), and *qudwah* (example). Transnational Islam, which adheres to strict, literal, and radical religious views, poses a threat to Indonesian *wasathiyah* Islam. Various *wasathiyah* Islamic institutions in Indonesia have been infiltrated by these ideas and practices. As a result, Indonesian *wasathiyah* Islam requires continuous development by reviving and actualizing itself. Indonesian *wasathiyah* Islam is undoubtedly "too big to fail" if this can be achieved successfully (Azra, 2020).

Every citizen, regardless of ethnicity, culture, religion, or political affiliation, must understand that moderation is a shared commitment to maintaining a complete balance in which they learn to listen to one another and exercise their ability to manage and overcome differences. An inclusive attitude must be avoided if moderation is to be achieved. To accommodate the diversity of Islamic thought, understanding and perception is inclusive according to Islamic thought. This way of thinking says that truth can be found not just in one group but also in other groups, like religious groups. This perspective departs from the notion that salvation teachings are common to all religions. (Jamaluddin, 2022). However, misperceptions, prejudices, and distortions ingrained in the subconscious of individuals from various civilisations continue to exist. As a result, the dialogue between them has yet to find common ground. As a result, these misconceptions can spill over and explode at any time. This trend shows evidence that civilised discourse and dialogue have not advanced significantly (Azra, 2002).

In religious moderation, there can be as many measures, limits, and indicators as possible to determine whether a particular religious perspective, attitude, and behaviour are classified as moderate or extreme. However, as an initial study during the period of Minister of Religious Affairs Lukman Hakim Saifuddin, who ordered the Research and Development and Training Agency to conduct a study, the indicators of religious moderation were crystallised as a first step, namely national commitment, tolerance, non-violence and accommodation to local culture (local wisdom). The four indicators can be used to recognise how strong religious moderation is practised by someone in Indonesia and how much vulnerability they have. These vulnerabilities need to be recognized in order to find or recognize and take appropriate measures to strengthen religious moderation. Of course, these four are not fixed prices but may later experience development or reduction, and/or changes will depend on the results of studies and research (Jamaluddin, 2022). National commitment is a very important indicator to see the extent to which a person's religious views, attitudes, and practices have an impact on loyalty to the fundamental national consensus, primarily related to the acceptance of Pancasila as the state ideology, his attitude towards ideological challenges that are opposite to Pancasila, and nationalism. Part of the national commitment is the acceptance of the nation's principles as stipulated in the 1945 Constitution and its regulations.

4.2. Local Religion in Interfaith Relations

At the beginning of the 20th century, a number of sociologists proposed the "secularisation thesis," which predicted that religion would eventually disappear from public life. However, the current state of affairs demonstrates the opposite: Religion increasingly interferes with people's social and political lives, not making it easier. Sociologists have reexamined the traditional thesis and provided new readings due to this reality. For instance, well-known sociologists like Peter Berger referred to the occurrence as "the resurgence of religion."

According to Berger's analysis, two primary factors sparked this religious revival: democratisation and information technology. Regarding the latter, democratisation has paved the way for the public emergence of faith-based sociopolitical movements rather than marginalising religion. As a result, several conflicts that involve religion to varying degrees have emerged. Religion is frequently a potent factor that mobilises the masses in conflicts and acts of violence that are frequently reported in the media. The interreligious dialogue initiative began in the context of religious revival and numerous religious-related conflicts. The history of interreligious dialogue exemplifies this effort's goal of minimising misperceptions between religions and preventing religions from being misappropriated in conflicts and violence. In addition, interreligious dialogue aims to unite religions around a shared moral obligation to address social issues.

World religions, on the other hand, have historically dominated interreligious dialogue. For instance, this is reflected in the book "The History of Interreligious Dialogue," (2013) by Leonard Swidler. Religious conflicts occur not only between world religions but also between local religions and world religions. Local religions are one source of reference that cannot be ignored when considering that the goal of interfaith dialog is not only the resolution of common problems related to social, economic, political, and, ultimately, ecological issues, but also theological issues. In his book "Interreligious Dialogue in a Polarized World," (2016), Richard Penaskovic emphasises the significance of interreligious dialogue not only regarding politics and terrorism but also regarding global climate change and environmental sustainability. On this last point, there is the potential loss of a valuable dialog partner if local religions are excluded from interfaith dialog.

Opportunities and challenges exist for local religions at this time. It is essential to acknowledge the significance of local religions to national and historical contexts. Indonesia is a pluralistic nation, which means that the Indonesian nation is diverse in terms of race, religion, gender, class, culture, and ethnicity. In essence, all Indonesian citizens share the same identity. Through nationality, this encourages conversation. Because each religion has its own perspective on nationality, the issue of nationality can serve as an alternative to dialogue as a space for an encounter between religions.

Mark Juergensmeyer, UC Santa Barbara professor of "religious radicalism," once told Azyumardi Azra that Pancasila is a blessing in disguise for the Indonesian nation because it is a deconfessional ideology. Because Pancasila is an ideology that supports religion, there is no valid reason (*raison d'etre*) to switch to another ideology. The vast majority of Indonesia's religious community will not support any attempt to replace Pancasila with another ideology, especially a religious one, and as a result, it will fail (Azra, 2020). The teachings of Mei Kartawinata, who penned his notes titled *"Pancasila dasar nagara, Pancasila dasar salira"*, indicate that Pancasila is an individual foundation for the life of the state and nation. Local religions, for instance, have a way of looking at Pancasila, which is the foundation of the Indonesian state. One of them discusses *Ka-Bangsaan Anu Buleud* in the book *"Pancasila Dasar Nagara, Sanes Agama,"* which explains that each person must be aware of their ancestral culture, language, and customs, regardless of the individual's religious, ethnic, cultural, gender, or other innate identities. The cultural ecosystem of the archipelago, which has become the nation's identity, must be preserved because it is an ancestral heritage that will be passed down to future generations.

Concerning Mei Kartawinata's background, he is one of the figures who consistently writes about nationality. Mei Kartawinata's experience indicates that he was a member of the labour organisation IDB *(Indische Drukkerij Bond*) and actively participated in its activities. IDB was an organisation that actively fought for the welfare of workers and, in particular, for equal rights for native workers and workers in Europe, which were extremely unequal at the time. Together with his friends, Mei Kartawinata's struggle evolved into an independence struggle. This was made clearer by the fact that Mei Kartawinata, who lived on Kebonjati Street and was Mei's neighbour, frequently talked to Sukarno, who was a student at THS/*Techniche Hoogeschool te Bandoeng* (ITB today) and lived in Sanoesi's house. At that time, Sanoesi's house in Bandung was frequently used as a location for the movement's discussions and meetings because they were neighbours on Kebonjati Street.

Local religions contribute to Indonesia's diversity in the historical sphere. Despite its obscure appearance, religion is connected to aspects of human life at any time and anywhere. Religion appears to be the foundation and source of human civilisation. Immigrants have

historically fueled religious and cultural diversity. Hinduism and Buddhism were brought to Sumatra by traders from India in the second and fourth centuries AD. Islam is thought to have arrived in Indonesia in the 14th century AD. According to some theories, Islam came to India and Gujarat, while others claim it came from Persia, China, or other places. But basically, Islam spread to Sumatra's west coast and then to Java's east. After that, the Portuguese introduced Catholicism to Indonesia, particularly on the islands of Timor and Flores. The Dutch introduced Protestant Christianity in the 16th century, influenced by Calvinist and Lutheran teachings.

With the local religions, various identities were brought together by the influx of religions. Local religion has always been a part of the culture in which the archipelago people live. Before world religions arrived in Indonesia, there were local religions. People already have a belief system distinct from other religious paradigms, which is interesting. When the archipelago people realised they were one with the natural world in a cosmological sense, they started practising local religions. The story of the universe's creation, the birth of humans, and a series of rituals to honour forces beyond themselves will emerge from this awareness. Because of the human connection to the power and supernatural secrets that give life and the universe around it meaning, this awareness is known as religion.

Environmental or ecological issues present a chance for local religions to talk to one another and work together. The widespread awareness of the current state of ecological degradation may serve as a starting point for including local religions in interreligious dialogue. Penaskovic says that social and environmental issues give rise to opportunities for the world and local interreligious dialogue that doesn't emphasise theological differences too much and can stay true to the goal of interreligious dialogue, which is to make the world a better place for people and their environment. It is therefore necessary to express gratitude for the recent acceptance and institutionalization of this concept. One tangible example is the Interfaith Rainforest Initiative (IRI), launched in Norway in 2017. This is not a typical event due to the central role played by indigenous peoples and local religions, many of whom live in equatorial regions' tropical rainforests. To put it another way, faith communities in the local area are at the forefront of global environmental issues (Bagir, 2017)

The fact that ecological issues are relevant to indigenous peoples or local religions is unique. Their perspective on the natural world is one of them. Forests are sacred entities and integral to many indigenous religions and local religions' religious practices. As a result, many local religious communities believe cutting down trees is against the law. Research carried out by Samsul Ma'arif (2015) investigates the religious notions of the Ammatoa people regarding social actors that transcend humans. The Ammatoans know that the cosmos is home to humans and non-human beings like land, trees, animals, etc. In this world, non-humans coexist with humans and share life with them. Humans and non-humans are considered individuals or subjects engaging in intersubjective relationships. The Ammatoa people's daily behaviour and practices, including forest conservation, are governed by religious perceptions of intersubjective relationships. Ammatoans strictly enforce a set of rules and penalties for forest conservation. What is known as "religious ecology" can be seen in the religious beliefs and practices of the Ammatoa people regarding the preservation of forests (Maarif, 2015).

Local religions' "theology of the forest" is one of many references that should play a central role in interfaith dialogue. To put it another way, excluding local religions from interreligious dialogue would eliminate a potential partner for the environmental paradigm of world religions, which is frequently referred to as "anthropocentric" and is regarded as the cause of ecological degradation by some scholars.

Despite the pressing need to involve local religions in interreligious dialogue, a few obstacles must be acknowledged. One of these is an attitude of condescension toward indigenous religions, which makes it difficult for dialogue to take place on an equal footing. Native People and Interreligious Dialogue in North America (1996) by James Treat illustrates how Western scholars participating in interreligious dialogue tend to focus solely on world religions and ignore what they call "tribal communities" in the Americas. The bias of the world religion paradigm, which labels local religions as "heathen," "animist," and "primitive society," has not entirely vanished from Western religionists' collective memory. This labelling makes it harder for local religions to participate in interfaith dialogue.

Interreligious dialogue occasionally becomes a means of converting local religious believers due to the paradigm that views local religious communities as inferior to world religions. In his book "*The Legacy of Arab-Islam in Africa*," John Azumah writes: A *Quest for Interreligious Dialogue* (2001) demonstrates how global religions, particularly Islam and Christianity, have

turned interreligious dialogue in Africa into an opportunity to spread their respective doctrines rather than comprehending the perspectives and experiences of local religious communities. "Interreligious dialogue" is now merely a strategy for acquiring new followers in this setting. As a result, it is necessary to keep in mind one of Abu Nimer's messages, which was that interreligious dialogue should not be used as a vehicle for da'wah or missionary work. At the same time, it encourages people of all faiths to reach spiritual and moral heights by treating them as fellow creatures of God. This way of looking at things, mainstream religious communities shouldn't feel threatened when the state acknowledges the existence of indigenous faith communities. In contrast, they can work together to build Indonesians who are spiritually and morally resilient and strong. In addition, mainstream religious communities can all take their role in the upbringing of their members more seriously. The pretence that some religious groups "save" people of indigenous and other religions needs to be looked at (Azra, 2020). Dialogue can only begin in a relationship of equality that does not view the partner in the dialogue as a target for conversion. Consequently, although difficult to avoid, it would be preferable to avoid theological issues at the outset. The dialogue can begin by facilitating encounters and dialogue that are more inclusive through ecological and social justice issues, on which local religions have numerous perspectives and experiences to share with people of all religions.

5. Discussion

This part digs into strict balance in Indonesia, featuring its rich history of interfaith exchange and social variety. A point of convergence is the meaning of Pancasila, an idea profoundly interlaced with balance standards. The story emphasizes the importance of understanding the various religious practices before delving into moderation. The concept of "religion" as a whole is looked at, with an emphasis on the Latin root "moderāte," which means to avoid extremes. The account highlights the basic job of balance in forestalling social divisions inside the multicultural scene of Indonesia. Despite the fact that local religions contribute to diversity, the section focuses on the potential difficulties they pose if they are not managed wisely.

The introduction of local religions in the context of interfaith relations challenges the secularization thesis and emphasizes a global religious revival. Local religions are credited with fostering interfaith dialogue and addressing a range of social, political and environmental issues. The discussion emphasizes the unique ecological perspectives embedded in the religions of the region, especially in relation to forest conservation. Despite these positive aspects, there are still significant obstacles to overcome, such as the possibility of using interfaith dialogue as a platform for conversion and condescending attitudes towards local religions. This section recognizes the invaluable contribution that local religions make to the broader interfaith discourse, especially in terms of addressing current global issues, and emphasizes the balance needed to overcome these obstacles.

An exploration of religious moderation in Indonesia reveals some strengths and areas for improvement. It articulates the historical context of interfaith dialogue and cultural diversity in Indonesia, offering a comprehensive view of religion and emphasizing the importance of accurate definitions. It explores the concept of moderation, linking it to its Latin roots and emphasizing its role in maintaining a balanced perspective, which is crucial to preventing social divisions in Indonesia's multicultural society. Turning to local religions in interfaith relations, the narrative highlights strengths such as opposing the secularization thesis, acknowledging the role of local religions in global issues, and discussing their ecological perspective. It also identifies potential challenges, including the risk of demonization and conversion attempts. Areas for improvement include including more specific examples in the section of challenges faced by indigenous religions and exploring practical strategies to overcome these challenges while encouraging their inclusion in interfaith dialogue.

Many human rights advocates and religious harmony organisations regard the Constitutional Court's (MK) decision to include "penghayat kepercayaan" in the religion column of ID cards as a significant historical event. The Constitutional Court's decision may end the hostile experience of penghayat kepercayaan, who frequently experience discrimination and unfair treatment concerning state services. While aliran kepercayaan, typically local, is distinct from religion, especially one that transcends regional, ethnic, and national boundaries and the state, there are also similarities and affinities between these two entities. Both faiths and religions strive to enhance the spirituality, behaviour, and morals of their followers or believers. From this point of view, adherents to mainstream religion ought to respect them (Azra, 2020).

Society is experiencing rapid change in the 21st century. The rapid shift toward society 5.0, accompanied by signs of economic and political instability, frequently brings about various other issues. Several issues arise from significant changes. Many parties are concerned about ideological, political, economic, ecological, and other issues. However, human resources (HR) frequently lack the knowledge and skills to solve these issues. As a result, conflicts frequently arise at various social levels. The fact that the discourse and praxis of dialogue between civilisations have increased over the past ten years but have not shown significant progress is indicated by this trend. Westerners may be surprised because they believe globalisation has increased the likelihood of "peaceful encounters of civilisations." This could be in the form of people travelling and physically moving across continents, especially to the West, or the spread of global culture originating in the West through Western assumptions, demonstrating a lack of comprehension of the dual nature of globalisation. On the one hand, globalisation is ultimately global because it involves the globalisation of transportation, telecommunications, political, economic, and political systems. On the other hand, the globalisation of Western culture and way of life, which has universal pretensions, has strengthened cultural resistance at the local and regional levels. Thus, there are simultaneously two trends in this cultural field: the increasing awareness of non-Western local and regional cultures on the one hand and the strengthening of the expansion of Western global culture on the other (Azra, 2002).

Even though local religions have been abandoned in recent decades. However, some practices still apply today. such as the human-environment relationship, which involves the individuals themselves and the entire universe they transmit. Although it may appear to be a time-honoured tradition, the practical practice of balancing one's needs with those of the natural world is frequently followed by modern urban dwellers to preserve customs without any real understanding of their meaning (Patru, 2022). According to Seyyed Hossein Nasr, the spiritual crisis is a problem that is dangerous for humans and has a significant impact. People become empty due to the spiritual crisis, and their actions become out of control as if there are no rules for how to behave in this world, including how to treat the environment. There has been a lot of talk about the study of environmental theology. In addition, some research has been done on environmental theology, which aims to awaken humans and make them more sensitive to their surroundings (Rafly et al., 2022). The relationship between humans and their surroundings has even entered the realm of thought, leading to the development of environmental theology. The world community is beginning to realise that the planet's future is in jeopardy as a result of industrialisation and technological and economic development. The global community must work together to address sustained, extensive environmental damage in various ways and across various scientific fields (Maftukhin, 2016).

Religions and culture are inseparable. Alternate perspectives on life emerged due to the presence of local religions in this period. Local religions can serve as both a legacy from the past and a reminder of Indonesia's diversity's birth at the community level. Deculturation, deterritorialisation, and decontextualisation will occur if religion and culture are separated. Whether it originated in a particular culture or was brought over from another, a religion will not exist in isolation. Within a culture, religion will experience inculturation. Culture and religion will coexist in harmony. Cultural signifiers are also religious signifiers. Anthropologists have developed numerous concepts to describe this relationship: syncretism, acculturation, hybridism, and mixing Islam are no longer a single religion. It led to Islam in Persian, Morocco, Javanese, and Sundanese, among other places. Islam is dependent on which culture develops. Deterritorialisation helps with this. To use this term, Oliver Roy says: Deterritorialization is not just about the movement of people, which only affects a small portion of the world's population, but also about the movement of ideas, cultural objects, information, and ways of understanding them in nonterritorial spaces. A religious object must appear universal and devoid of any connection to a particular culture to spread, and its message must be understandable to be conveyed.

Acculturation or deculturation are the outcomes of deterritorialisation. Religion is distinct from culture. The fundamentalist religion replaces the religion of the accommodationists, for those who favour accommodation. They believe that the pagans and their culture and values are compatible. Faith is the criterion of separation for fundamentalists: Only people of the same faith can share with you. As a result, religion turned against the culture around it, which is now seen as pagan rather than secular. Additionally, the space between the two is lost. The desire to define religion's purity presents a temptation (Rakhmat, 2021b). Indonesia's local religions significantly contribute to the discussion of religious moderation. This is obvious in a review started by Priest of Strict Undertakings Lukman Hakim Saifuddin, which laid out markers for strict balance, including public responsibility, resilience, peacefulness, and convenience to nearby culture (local wisdom). The consideration of "accommodation to local culture" highlights the significance of perceiving and embracing the variety of nearby religions, integrating their qualities and practices into the more extensive structure of strict control. This strategy emphasizes the importance of fostering religious moderation by comprehending and accepting the distinctive contributions of local belief systems, while also acknowledging Indonesia's rich cultural tapestry. The study emphasizes the dynamic nature of religious moderation and its responsiveness to Indonesia's diverse religious landscape. It acknowledges that these indicators are not fixed but may evolve based on ongoing research.

Pancasila, as the foundation of the Indonesian state, dramatically influences all aspects of life (Pakpahan et al., 2021). Although Pancasila is not a religion, its values can complement religious understanding and have proven to produce inclusive values. Pancasila has proven to be the most attainable and, as a result, a more enduring ideological common platform for the nation's current and future existence. So far, there is still no alternative ideology other than a common platform that is acceptable to citizens and feasible for the future development of the Indonesian nation-state. Even though there are still gaps and inconsistencies between Pancasila's ideals and the reality of the nation-state's existence, this should not diminish its significance. It should be the impetus for even greater efforts to continue putting the Pancasila spirit, principles, and values into practice that there are differences and disparities (Azra, 2020). As a result, diversity in Pancasila theology is essential. Earth is the source of this theological idea. The indigenous Pancasila theology promotes politeness and friendliness in religious practice. Because of this, the Pancasila system of diversity enshrined all of these values (Mukhlis, 2016). When looking back at the topic of local religions, it reminds us of the presence of the Indonesian nation with Pancasila, which always goes hand in hand with diversity and existing religions so that the noble values that are owned can be passed on to future generations for sustainable survival.

6. Conclusions

In fact, local religions have contributed and have a position in interfaith relations as a form of religious moderation, especially in the value of religious moderation related to the accommodation of local wisdom. The values contained in local religions and the moderation that exists in religion can coexist. The ancestral religions of the archipelago and local religions carry ideas relevant to the changing times and can continue to exist. As a result, local religions in Indonesia help religious moderation and interfaith relations.

Through the study of local religions, this research offers a perspective on how local religions influence religious moderation in Indonesia. Moderation is shaped by nationality, history, and awareness of the relationship with the universe or environment. Local religions provide the Pancasila perspective through the aspects of nationality and history. On the other hand, local religions provide space to build a harmonious society by raising awareness of the relationship with the universe or the environment. This study shows that the aspects of history and nationality that always go hand in hand with preserving natural harmony and the environment contribute to religious moderation in local religions.

This paper emphasizes the importance of engaging Indonesia's religions in discussions about moderate behaviour and character development. Involving scholars and academics in character development in line with local religious principles is essential to improve our understanding of religious moderation in Indonesia. A strong foundation for understanding and policy development will need to be provided to understand how religious moderation develops in local community settings. In order to increase understanding of the complexities surrounding religious moderation in the Indonesian context and to improve social conditions, future research efforts should actively engage local religious believers, academics and policymakers.

7. Conflicts of Interest

The author explicitly states that there is no conflict of interest in writing this article.

References

Adnan, R. S., & Somantri, G. R. (2022). Social Conflict among Mining Company and

Community. Indonesian Journal of Religion and Society, 4(1), 28–40. doi: 10.36256/ijrs.v4i1.246

- Akhmadi, A. (2019). Moderasi Beragama dalam Keragaman Indonesia. Jurnal Diklat Keagamaan, 13(2), 45–55.
- Ali-Fauzi, I., Rafsadi, I., Sila, A., Sumaktoyo, N. G., Nuraniyah, N., Maarif S., Jaffrey, S., & Bagir, Z.A. (2017). Kebebasan, Toleransi dan Terorisme: Riset dan Kebijakan Agama di Indonesia (Vol. 1).
- Azra, A. (2002). Konflik Baru Antar Peradaban Globalisasi, Radikalisme, dan Pluralitas (Pertama; Idris Thaha, Ed.). Jakarta: PT. RajaGrafindo Persada.
- Azra, A. (2020). Relevansi Islam Wasathiyah dari Melindungi Kampus Hingga Mengaktualisasi Kesalehan (pertama; Idris Thaha, Ed.). Jakarta: PT. Kompas Media Nusantara.

Bagir, Z. A., & Maarif, S. (2016). Studi agama di Indonesia : refleksi pengalaman.

Bagir, Z.A. (2017). Menyelamatkan Hutan: Aliansi Lintas Agama dan Masyarakat Adat.

- Budijanto, O. W. (2016). Penghormatan Hak Asasi Manusia Bagi Penghayat Kepercayaan Di Kota Bandung. *Jurnal HAM*, 7(1), 35. doi: 10.30641/ham.2016.7.35-44
- Fahri, M., & Zainuri, A. (2019). Moderasi Beragama di Indonesia. 25(2). doi: 10.19109/intizar.v25i2.5640
- Gianni, M. (2023). For a political conception of multicultural citizenship. *Ethnicities*, 23(4), 583–600. doi: 10.1177/14687968221149741
- Hasibuan, H.H. (2019). Moderasi Islam Pencantuman Penghayat Kepercayaan Di Kolom KTP/KK Dalam Nalar Maqasid. *Jurnal Aqlam-Journal of Islam and Plurality*, 4(2). Retrieved from https://news.detik.com/berita/d-
- Jamaluddin. (2022). Implementasi Moderasi Beragama di Tengah Multikulturalitas Indonesia (Analisis Kebijakan Implementatif pada Kementerian Agama). AS-SALAM Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu-IlmuKeislaman, 7(1), 1–13.
- Junaedi, E. (2019). Inilah Moderasi Beragama Perspektif Kemenag. Harmoni, 18(2), 182-186. doi: 10.32488/harmoni.v18i2.414
- Jupri. (2015). Etos Kerja dan Religiusitas Sopir Angkutan: Studi di Kabupaten Bulukumba. Sosioreligius: Jurnal Ilmiah Sosiologi Agama, 1(1), 1–18.
- Kartawinata, M., & Pujanegara, A. S. (2022). Seratan Pamendak Mei Kartawinata (1st ed., Vol. 1; A. Setia Pujanegara, Ed.). Bandung: Budi Daya.
- Kulikov, S. B., & Shirokova, A. V. (2021). Artificial intelligence, culture and education. *AI* & *SOCIETY*, *36*(1), 305–318. doi: 10.1007/s00146-020-01026-7
- Maarif, S. (2015). Ammatoan Indigenous Religion and Forest Conservation. *Worldviews*, 19(2), 144–160. doi: 10.1163/15685357-01902005
- Maarif, S. (2019). Bacaan Pendamping Film Atas Nama Percaya.
- Maftukhin. (2016). Teologi lingkungan perspektif seyyed hossein nasr. Dinamika Penelitian, 16(2), 337–352.
- Marzali, A. (2017). Agama dan Kebudayaan. Umbara, 1(1). doi: 10.24198/umbara.v1i1.9604
- Melia, Y. (2022). Symbolic Violence In Educational Institutions in Indonesia; Case Study of Private High School in Padang City, West Sumatera. Indonesian Journal of Religion and Society, 4(2), 80–87. doi: 10.36256/ijrs.v4i2.283

Miharja, D. (2017). Adat, Budaya Dan Agama Lokal Studi Gerakan Ajeg Bali Agama Hindu Bali. *Kalam*, 7(1), 53. doi: 10.24042/klm.v7i1.444

- Mukhlis, F. H. (2016). Teologi Pancasila: Teologi Kerukunan Umat Beragama. FIKRAH, 4(2), 171. doi: 10.21043/fikrah.v4i2.1885
- Muna, C., & Lestari, P. (2023). Penguatan Agama Dan Wawasan Budaya Sebagai Upaya dalam Menumbuhkan Spirit Moderasi Beragama. *Al-Afkar, Journal For Islamic Studies*, 6(1), 236–251.
- Muttaqien, A. (2013). Spiritualitas Agama Lokal (Studi Ajaran Sunda Wiwitan aliran Madrais di Cigugur Kuningan Jawabarat). *Al-Adyan Jurnal Studi Lintas Agama*, *VIII*(1), 89–102.
- Pakpahan, G. K., Salman, I., Setyobekti, A. B., Sumual, I. S., & Christi, A. M. (2021). Internalisasi nilai-nilai Pancasila dalam upaya mencegah radikalisme. *KURIOS*, 7(2), 435–445. doi: 10.30995/kur.v7i2.351
- Patru, A. (2022). Folk Religion in Transformation: A Religious Studies Perspective Based on Examples from Romania. *Religions*, 13(10), 991. doi: 10.3390/rel13100991

Radix, P. D., & Siti, N. H. (2019). Studi Kasus Metode Penelitian Kualitatif.

Rafly, F.M.S., Muhlas, & Munir. (2022). Analisis Teologi Lingkungan Seyyed Hossein Nasr

Terhadap Krisis Air di Masyarakat Batujaya Karawang. Jurnal Riset Agama, 2(3), 36–49.

- Rakhmat, J. (2021a). *Psikologi Agama Sebuah Pengantar* (Kedua). Bandung: PT. Mizan Pustaka.
- Rakhmat, J. (2021b). Rekayasa Sosial Reformasi, Revolusi, dan Relasi Media-Agama atas Kuasa (Kedua). Bandung: Simbiosa Rekatama Media.
- Saputra, R., Putra, R., & Putri, E. W. (2021). Moderasi Islam Ahmad Syafii Maarif (Kontribusinya terhadap Pluralitas Agama di Indonesia). *Fikrah: Jurnal Ilmu Aqidah Dan Studi Keagamaan*, 9(1), 63–84. doi: 10.21043/fikrah.v8i1.
- Sirnopati, R. (2021). Agama Lokal Pribumi Sasak (Menelusuri Jejak "Islam Wetu Telu" Di Lombok). *Tsaqofah*, 19(02), 103. doi: 10.32678/tsaqofah.v19i02.3656
- Sudirman, S. A. (2022). Assessing Justice: Exploring the Role of Values in Defining Fairness. *Indonesian Journal of Religion and Society*, 4(2), 140–155. doi: 10.36256/ijrs.v4i2.330
- Sutrisno, E. (2019). Aktualisasi Moderasi Beragama di Lembaga Pendidikan. Jurnal Bimas Islam, 12(2), 323–348. doi: 10.37302/jbi.v12i2.113
- Tahar, A., Setiadi, P. B., & Rahayu, S. (2022). Strategi Pengembangan Sumber Daya Manusia dalam Menghadapi Era Revolusi Industri 4.0 Menuju Era Society 5.0. Jurnal Pendidikan Tambusai, 6(2), 12380–12394.
- Tama, Y. W., & Sulistyaningrum, S. D. (2023). A Systematic Literature Review of Islamophobia on Media: Trends, Factors, and Stereotypes. Indonesian Journal of Religion and Society, 5(1), 14–23. doi: 10.36256/ijrs.v5i1.288
- Tresnasih, R. I., Rostiyati, A., Merlina, N., & Lasmiyati, L. (2023). Leuit Sebagai Simbol Kearifan Lokal. *Paradigma: Jurnal Kajian Budaya*, 13(2). doi: 10.17510/paradigma.v13i2.1269
- Viri, K., & Febriany, Z. (2020). Dinamika Pengakuan Penghayat Kepercayaan di Indonesia. Indonesian Journal of Religion and Society, 2(2), 97–112. doi: 10.36256/ijrs.v2i2.119
- Yusuf, M., Afrizal, A., & Alfiandi, B. (2022). Meta Analisis Studi Kelas Menengah Muslim di Indonesia. Indonesian Journal of Religion and Society, 4(1), 1–16. doi: 10.36256/ijrs.v4i1.238